



Appendix 4

**Request for Proposals to Design-Build-Finance-  
Maintain Trillium Line Extension Project  
(RFP# 09717-94065-P01)**

**Confidential**

**Fairness Commissioner's Interim Attestation  
Report #2**

**January 10<sup>th</sup>, 2019**

Submitted by:





**Request for Proposals to Design-Build-Finance-Maintain Trillium Line  
Extension Project (RFP# 09717-94065-P01)  
City of Ottawa – Stage 2 Light Rail Office  
Interim Fairness Report #2**

**1. Interim Fairness Attestation**

P3 Advisors is engaged as the Fairness Commissioner to monitor the processes of communication, evaluation and decision-making associated with the procurement process for the Request for Proposals to Design-Build-Finance-Maintain the Trillium Line Extension Project RFP #09717-94065-P01 issued by the City of Ottawa Stage 2 Light Rail Office (City). Our role relates to ensuring openness, fairness, consistency and transparency of the procurement process.

P3 Advisors hereby presents its post-consensus procurement fairness attestation report to the City at the conclusion of this stage in the procurement process, describing how the procurement process has complied with requirements. The following chart included below is in accordance with the RFP and the City evaluation guidelines presented during the Evaluator Training Sessions. It summarizes P3 Advisors involvement and findings, as follows:

P3 Advisors performed the following tasks and our finding:

#	Task	Fair (Yes / No)
<b>General</b>		Yes
1.	Confirm that the Project participants, including the Evaluators, did not have any conflicts of interest and that they would comply with the confidentiality requirements related to the procurement process	Yes
2.	Review situations of conflict of interest (actual, perceived and potential), from a fairness perspective, in order to make a determination	Yes
3.	Ensure that documents are store securely and that the records management process is adhered to; and that evaluators are aware and abide by document security protocol and confidentiality, as applicable	Yes
<b>Request for Proposals</b>		
4.	Reviewed draft RFP documentation to identify potential inconsistencies or lack of clarity in the RFP and provide feedback to the City	Yes
5.	Ensured that project meetings (mandatory or not) were clearly identified in the RFP and confirmed there were no meetings related to the procurement that the Proponents were not notified of	Yes
6.	Ensured that: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The time and method of the closing were clearly identified in the RFP</li> <li>The Mandatory requirements were adhered to for the Proposals that were evaluated in accordance with the City's policies</li> </ul>	Yes Yes
7.	Attended and monitored all meetings with the Proponents	Yes
8.	Ensured that answers were made available to all Proponents for all questions that were submitted	Yes
9.	Reviewed Proponent questions and the City's responses	Yes
10.	Reviewed and approved amendments and addenda	Yes
11.	Ensured that the evaluation criteria and process were included in the RFP	Yes
12.	Reviewed evaluation, scoring procedures and related documents (Evaluation Orientation) with respect to clarity & consistency	Yes
13.	Confirmed confidentiality commitments by all Evaluators	Yes
14.	Attended internal meetings related to the evaluation process	Yes
15.	Ensured that the composition of the evaluation committee adhered to the evaluation process	Yes
16.	Review request for clarification to ensure that they are consistent with the procurement documents	Yes



**Request for Proposals to Design-Build-Finance-Maintain Trillium Line  
Extension Project (RFP# 09717-94065-P01)  
City of Ottawa – Stage 2 Light Rail Office  
Interim Fairness Report #2**

#	Task	Fair (Yes / No)
17.	Attended and monitored technical and financial evaluation consensus sessions (Evaluation against Rated Requirements)	Yes
18.	Ensured that the evaluation criteria were applied consistently and fairly	Yes
19.	Reviewed evaluation results for the Evaluation Criteria	Yes
20.	Confirmed that the evaluation results were consistent with our observations	Yes
21.	Participate in Senior Management, Committee and Council Meetings where the project results are discussed or disclosed	Yes
22.	Participate in the Negotiations (upon request) to ensure that they are consistent with the prescribed process	Yes
23.	Attend debriefing sessions related to RFP as required	To be scheduled
24.	Provided a report of the conclusion of the RFP process on the fairness, openness and transparency of the process	Yes

\*This report has been provided, upon request, in advance of the Award and Debriefings. A final Fairness Attestation shall be provided to the City post Contract Award.

**2. Observations and Findings**

The City’s evaluation team and its Advisors prepared comprehensive documentation related to the RFP for the Trillium Line Extension Project (RFP# 09717-94065-P01). They responded positively to all fairness comments and questions and promptly addressed issues during the procurement.

The procurement process is clearly established in the Request for Proposals. The evaluation process and criteria described in the RFP were applied consistently and equitably. In the final evaluation discussions, the evaluators demonstrated that they had been diligent in their responsibilities, they were able to support their individual evaluation assessments, and they did not appear to have any bias for or against any Proponent. The evaluation team reached consensus scores on all criteria for all Proposals.

There were no unresolved issues at the RFP stage of the procurement at the time of this report.

**3. Conclusion**

As the Lead Fairness Commissioner for the City of Ottawa RFP for the Trillium Line Extension Project (RFP# 09717-94065-P01), overall, and to the extent that we have been involved in the RFP process we certify, in our opinion that, up to the point at which this Report was delivered, the process was undertaken in a fair, open, and transparent manner.

Oliver Grant, Fairness Commissioner  
**P3 Advisors**

cc.:  
Louise Panneton, Executive Sponsor  
**P3 Advisors**